

Explanatory Note

The paper "Edward Bunting's Annotated Volumes of Irish Music: An Overlooked Treasure at the British Library" was written as a small research project in 2010. This paper was not intended for publication in its present form, however some recent interest in the information in BL Addl 41508 has prompted me to upload it here. My intention at the time of writing was primarily to try to understand if BL Addl 41508 (Edward Bunting's personal copies of his first two volumes of Irish harp music) was known to the research community, and if the manuscript annotations in these two volumes were Bunting's own work. I hope readers of this paper will forgive its shortcomings (it is uploaded here 'as is'), and not read it as critical of the work of others, as that was not my intention in writing it.

The associated "Table of Annotations in BL Addl 41508, Edward Bunting's Annotated Volumes of Irish Music" is very much a work in progress, and is not complete. I have, however, included it here in its current state as the information in it may be of use to other researchers.

- Karen Loomis, 7 March 2014

Edward Bunting's Annotated Volumes of Irish Music: An Overlooked Treasure at the British Library

*Karen Loomis
15 April, 2010
(images redacted)*

At the close of the 18th century, Edward Bunting was enlisted to transcribe music at a gathering of Irish harpers in Belfast.¹ Inspired, he went on to make collecting Irish music, in particular Irish harp music, his life's work.² The harpers that Bunting met in Belfast and elsewhere in Ireland were, as it turns out, the last surviving generation of a musical tradition that had spanned several centuries.³ Today, his fieldwork is the primary source of historical Irish harp music⁴, and he is justifiably credited with having preserved it at the last possible moment before the tradition ceased to exist.⁵ His vast legacy of nearly 4000 pages of manuscript notes is preserved in the archives of the Library at Queen's University, Belfast,⁶ and current Bunting scholars have

¹ Fox, C.M. (1912) *Annals of the Irish Harpers*. New York, E.P. Dutton & Company, p. 99.

² O'Sullivan, D. (1926) The Bunting Collection of Irish Folk Music and Songs, I, *Journal of the Irish Folk Song Society*, 22-23, p. xiii.

³ Chadwick, S. (2008) The Early Irish Harp, *Early Music*, 36 (4), p. 521.

⁴ Heymann, A. (1988) *Secrets of the Gaelic Harp*, Minneapolis, Clairseach Publications, p. 11.

⁵ Fox, C. M. (1912) p. 309-310.

⁶ The Library at Queens, Special Collections, MS/4, *Bunting Manuscript Collection*.

assumed that essentially all of his surviving archival material was held there.⁷ The author has, however, recently discovered an overlooked manuscript at the British Library: Bunting's own copies of his first two published volumes with extensive hand written annotations and revisions to the printed music.⁸ The potential importance of these annotated volumes to research of Edward Bunting, historical Irish music, and the Irish harp tradition cannot be overstated. This paper presents an overview of the contents of the annotations, their significance, possible purpose, and a discussion of the source of the volumes and annotations.

Edward Bunting was born in Armagh, Ireland in 1773.⁹ At an early age, he showed an innate musical talent, and at the age of 11 was apprenticed to William Ware, head organist at St Ann's Church in Belfast.¹⁰ Bunting excelled as a music student, and within a few years was giving piano lessons to ladies in Belfast's high society.¹¹ He continued to work as sub-organist under Ware and his musical talents quickly became known around Belfast.¹²

In December 1791, when Bunting was just turning 19, the newly formed Belfast Society for Promoting knowledge circulated a flyer proposing to attempt to "revive and perpetuate the ancient Music and Poetry of Ireland...to preserve from oblivion the few fragments which have been permitted to remain, as monuments of the refined taste and genius of their ancestors." The flyer goes on to propose that "the Harpers should be induced to assemble at Belfast...and that a person well versed in the language and antiquities of this nation should attend, with a skilful musician to transcribe and arrange the most beautiful and interesting parts of their knowledge."¹³ The driving force behind this gathering was Dr. James MacDonnell, the prominent Belfast physician and philanthropist who, as a boy had been taught to play by the harper Arthur O'Neill, and therefore had a personal interest in preserving the music.¹⁴ In a broader sense, the Society's interest in showcasing Irish harp music grew out of a desire to support the growing nationalist movement by encouraging Irish cultural identity.¹⁵ It is important to note that it was their intention to collect the music and publish it, but in order to entice the public to buy the printed music,¹⁶ it needed to be arranged for an instrument that people generally could play.¹⁷ In late 18th century, Ireland that instrument was the piano forte, not the Irish harp. In particular, it was

⁷ The author has communicated with the following researchers: Simon Chadwick, Historical Harp Society of Ireland; Séan Donnelly, Historical Harp Society of Ireland; Ann Heymann, Clairseach Publications; and Colette Moloney, Waterford Institute of Technology.

⁸ British Library, BL Addl 41508, *Bunting Collection*, Vol I.

⁹ O'Sullivan (1926), p. xiii.

¹⁰ Fox, C. M. (1912) p. 11.

¹¹ Ibid., p. 12.

¹² Petrie, G. (1847) Our Portrait Gallery.-No. XLI., *Dublin University Magazine*, 29 (169) January, p.67.

¹³ quoted in Fox, C. M. (1912), pp. 97-98.

¹⁴ Fox, C. M. pp. 6-8.

¹⁵ Lanier, S. C. (1999), "It is New-Strung and Shan't be Heard": Nationalism and Memory in the Irish Harp Tradition, *British Journal of Ethnomusicology*, 8, pp. 4-6.

¹⁶ Johnston, R. (2003) *Bunting's Messiah*, Belfast, Belfast Natural History and Philosophical Society, p. 45.

¹⁷ Ibid., p. 42

the square piano, which was a hugely popular parlour instrument¹⁸, and because of Bunting's reputation in Belfast for keyboard musicianship, he was the "skilful musician" hired to attend the meeting of harpers to transcribe the music and prepare piano forte arrangements for publication. The gathering, which was planned to coincide with a visit to Belfast by Wolfe Tone and the United Irishmen, was held at the Old Exchange and Assembly Rooms in Belfast, on 11-13 July 1792.¹⁹ Ten harpers attended, including MacDonnell's teacher, Arthur O'Neill²⁰ and, most significantly for modern study of early Irish harp technique, Dennis Hempson (a.k.a. O'Hampsey), who at 97 years of age was not only the oldest harper in attendance, but was also the only one still using the traditional technique of playing with the fingernails.²¹ Bunting carefully transcribed the music played by the harpers, paying particular attention to O'Hampsey, and his repertoire²², and in 1796, Bunting published the first of three volumes of piano forte arrangements of Irish music collected by him at the Belfast harp gathering and elsewhere in Ireland.²³

The Belfast meeting had inspired Bunting to make collecting Irish music his life's work, and he went out into the field, collecting airs from harpers and other sources in numerous locations in Ireland over a period of at least ten years, enlisting Irish speakers to collect song texts as well.²⁴ He devoted the rest of his life to researching, editing, and arranging the vast body of information he had collected in the field. Bunting's second and third volumes of Irish music, published in 1809 and 1840,²⁵ are each prefaced by an extended dissertation with detailed background information on the music, the harpers, their instruments, and playing technique. This published material has provided a great deal of essential information for the modern revival of the early Irish harp, although the piano forte arrangements of the airs are of limited value for performance on that instrument.

If all that survived of Bunting's work was his three published volumes, he would still be remembered for his important contribution to scholarship of the early Irish harp. In 1907, however, Charlotte Milligan Fox walked into a London harp warehouse to purchase a harp and when she inquired if any Irish harpers had ever passed through was told that a gentleman had just been in who'd said that his grandfather was the man who "preserved the music of the ancient Irish harpers".²⁶ That man was Dr. Louis MacRory, grandson of Edward Bunting. When Fox contacted him, he presented her with a box full of Bunting's original manuscript notebooks of his work collecting Irish music.²⁷ This vast body of work, which had not been seen since Bunting's lifetime, has made it possible to begin to reconstruct the original performances of the music on the early Irish harp. It is painstaking work, however, so

¹⁸ Cole, M. (2009) *Square Pianos: A Brief History*, Square Pianos, <http://www.squarepianos.com/square.htm> Accessed 12 April, 2010.

¹⁹ Moloney, C. (2000), p. 8.

²⁰ O'Sullivan, D. (1926), p. xiv.

²¹ Johnston, R. (2003), p.43.

²² *ibid.*

²³ Bunting, E. (1796) *A General Collection of the Ancient Irish Music*. London, Preston & Son.

²⁴ O'Sullivan, D. (1926), pp. xiii-xvii.

²⁵ Bunting, E. (1809) *A General Collection of the Ancient Music of Ireland*. London, Clementi and Company, and (1840) *The Ancient Music of Ireland*. Dublin, Hodges and Smith.

²⁶ Fox, C. M. (1912), p. viii.

²⁷ *ibid.*

every scrap of archival material is a potentially valuable source to inform the interpretation of the music. Although a large part of Bunting's manuscript material is preserved, it is clear from the gaps in his work that there is missing material. Given the serendipitous nature of Fox's discovery of Bunting's manuscripts, it's possible that additional surviving material will come to light. Since Fox's initial discovery, two manuscripts have, in fact, been found, adding important material to the surviving body of work.²⁸ In 2009, the author discovered a significant additional source of archival material, Bunting's personal copies of his first two published volumes of Irish music, bound together in one volume and currently held at the British Library.²⁹ This double volume contains 90 folios (including interleaves) of extensive hand written annotations and revisions to the notated music. The annotations include original material that has not appeared in publication and is not found in any of Bunting's other surviving archival material, the revisions to the music are also original and have not been seen elsewhere. The author has requested a scan of the entire contents and has copied all of the annotations and music revisions into a facsimile copy of both volumes.

Before discussing the content of the annotations, it is important to identify the handwriting. All of the annotations appear to be written by the same hand. Were they written by Edward Bunting? A sample scan of the annotations was sent to three Bunting scholars for identification.³⁰ Two replied, but neither gave a definitive identification.³¹ The author has compared the handwriting to samples that have been identified as Bunting's in his manuscript notebooks from the 1790's. This handwriting is somewhat different to that found in the annotated volumes, but this may be due to the long time span between the notebooks and the annotated volumes. Bunting was a very young man when he penned the handwriting in his notebooks, whereas the annotations in his published volumes were written after 1840,³² when Bunting was nearly 70 years old. It is also possible that the handwriting belongs to one of Bunting's scribes. Bunting is known to have used secretaries to write some of his notes. Moloney (2000) identified 84 separate forms of handwriting in Bunting's notebooks.³³ Based on the content of the annotations, they were written by someone who had information that is only found in Bunting's notebooks.³⁴ They were also likely written before about 1850, due to the use of the "long s" in the script.³⁵ This points to the annotations being written either by Bunting himself, or on his behalf, and probably rules out the likely modern candidates, Edward Bunting's grandson, who's

²⁸ Carolan, N. and Donnelly, S., referenced in Moloney (2000), p. 447.

²⁹ British Library, BL Addl 41508, *Bunting Collection*, Vol I.

³⁰ Séan Donnelly, Ann Heymann, and Colette Moloney (see note 7).

³¹ Moloney, C. (2009) personal communication, and Heymann, A. (2009) personal communication.

³² This date is based on the content that refers to the "1840" volume (e.g. BL Addl 41508, Bunting (1796) f. 72v, p. 4, *Girls Have You Seen George*, "Set 1840", and f. 75r, p. 9, *Madam Cole*, "Set in 1840").

³³ Moloney (2000), pp. 707-712.

³⁴ e.g. BL Addl 41508, Bunting (1809) f. 51v, p. 46 *Felican / The Butterfly*, "One of the easy lessons first taught to the young harpers", and Bunting, E. ms 33(3), f. 9r, "second or third tune learned on the harp".

³⁵ Norman, J. (2004-2010) *Gradual Disappearance of the Long S in Typography (Circa 1800 – 1820)* [Internet] HistoryofScience.com. <http://www.historyofscience.com/G2I/timeline/index.php?id=2729> [Accessed 13 April 2010]

name is written on the title page of the 1809 volume in a different hand, Charlotte Milligan Fox, who had Bunting's manuscript notebooks, and published material from them, and Donal O'Sullivan, who had access to the manuscript notebooks in the 1920's to prepare his edited version of the published volumes. For comparison, a sample of handwriting from the annotated volume is reproduced in figure 1, and a sample of handwriting, identified as Edward Bunting's, from one of his manuscript notebooks is reproduced in figure 2.

Figure 1.

Handwritten annotations in the bottom margin of Bunting (1809), BL Addl 41508, p. 40 (f. 47v), “Marcaigheacht in Boinne – The Cavalcade of the Boyne”.

Figure 2.

Handwriting identified as Edward Bunting’s on the reverse of p. 65 of Bunting ms33(3), the Bunting Collection, MS / 4, the Library, Queen’s University, Belfast.

Note the appearance of the “long s” in the word “permission” in the last line of the annotation reproduced in Figure 1. The two handwriting samples reproduced in Figures 1 and 2 do look similar, although perhaps not identical. Figure 2 is an early

sample of Bunting's handwriting, however. The handwriting of the annotations needs to be compared to that from later in Bunting's life, roughly contemporary to when they were written. Whether or not the handwriting is Edward Bunting's, is there anything in the content of the annotations to indicate that these are his notes? There are a few self references, e.g. on f. 57r, the interleave facing p. 54, the annotations read, "This air in my 1st vol:1796 is so unlike his other melody's [sic]".³⁶ This is written in the same hand as the rest of the annotations, indicating that these are, in fact, Bunting's personal notes.

A second important issue to consider is whether any modern researchers were aware of these two annotated volumes and, if not, why have they been overlooked. Moloney (2000) does not reference or even mention them, except for one indirect comment on Donal O'Sullivan having obtained information from "Bunting's own copy" of his 1796 volume.³⁷ In recent communications, Moloney indicated that she was aware of them, and had looked at them a couple of years ago.³⁸ There is some very interesting evidence regarding Donal O'Sullivan's possible use of at least one of the volumes while he researched Bunting's archival material for his edited version of Bunting's collected music. In appendices I and II of this paper, partial lists of the annotations giving sources for the airs are cross referenced with the sources catalogued by Moloney (2000) from Bunting's manuscript notebooks and the sources given by O'Sullivan (1925-1939) in his edited publication of Bunting's collection. For the entries from the 1809 volume, listed in Appendix I, there is not much overlap between the sources given in the annotated volume and those given by Moloney and O'Sullivan. The annotations give sources for several airs that do not have sources listed for them in either Moloney or O'Sullivan, indicating that neither had seen this volume and that it is a unique source of information that may have come from Bunting's missing notebooks. For some of the airs the sources are different than those listed by Moloney and O'Sullivan. This could be due to Bunting collecting the air from more than one source, which he is known to have done.³⁹ It has also been suggested that the sources listed in the annotated volume could be spurious.⁴⁰

The listing in Appendix II of cross-referenced sources for the 1796 volume has some very interesting entries. The source information given by O'Sullivan (1925-1939) (often without direct reference) appears to have been quoted directly from the annotations in this volume. This information is absent from Moloney (2000), indicating that it is not in Bunting's surviving manuscript notebooks. In fact, Moloney points this out in the introduction to her Bunting catalogue: "He [O'Sullivan] attributes tunes and texts to particular individuals, but he does not always supply the source of this information. While it is possible to trace some of O'Sullivan's attributions, particularly of texts, as being from superscriptions to manuscript items, included in indexes or as being added to Bunting's 'personal copy of the 1796', it is now unclear where many were obtained."⁴¹ It is evident from the

³⁶ BL Addl 41508, Bunting (1796), f. 57r, facing p. 54.

³⁷ Moloney (2000), p. 155.

³⁸ Moloney, C. referenced in Donnelly, S., personal communication (Nov., 2009), Moloney, C., personal communication (December, 2009)

³⁹ e.g. Burn's March (see Moloney (2000), p. 475).

⁴⁰ Chadwick, S., personal communication (April, 2010).

⁴¹ Moloney, p. 155.

close correspondence between the information in O'Sullivan's publication and the annotated Bunting (1796) that this is where these attributions were obtained. Moloney's confusion is understandable, because this volume is not clearly listed in his bibliography.⁴² O'Sullivan does mention Bunting's personal copy of the 1796 volume in his entry for the air "The Foxes Sleep", stating that "According to a note written by Bunting in his personal copy of the 1796 volume (which is deposited with his manuscripts) he obtained 'The Fox's Sleep' from Dennis Hempson, the blind harper of Magilligan, County Derry, in 1792".⁴³ This indicates that the annotated Bunting (1796) was with the archived Bunting collection when O'Sullivan was doing the research for his publication in the 1920's and 1930's, and Moloney's comment about O'Sullivan indicates that it was not with the collection at Queen's University, Belfast when she was doing the research for her Bunting catalogue in the 1990's. A copy of each of Bunting's published volumes is included in the hand list to the Bunting archive at Queen's University, but there is no indication that these are the annotated copies.⁴⁴ BL Addl 41508, Bunting (1809) is signed on the title page by Bunting's grandson, Louis MacRory, which suggests that it may have been with the Bunting manuscripts he gave to Charlotte Milligan Fox. If this is true, it is a mystery how it and the annotated 1796 volume ended up bound together in the collection of the British Library. It is interesting that the BL combined volume was last bound in 1938⁴⁵, as this is not long after Donal O'Sullivan finished his research. One can conclude from all of this evidence that no researcher since O'Sullivan was aware of the existence of the annotated Bunting (1796) volume, and that no researchers to date are aware of the existence of the annotated Bunting (1809) volume.

The annotations in the two volumes can be categorized as follows: tune sources (as noted above), anecdotal and historical background information, and commentary on the music - including extended commentary on Turlough O'Carolan, the Irish harper and composer. The O'Carolan commentary is extremely interesting, has not been seen elsewhere, and is a worthy topic for a paper of its own. Two examples are transcribed in Appendix III. The first, on the lack of Irishness in Carolan's musical style and false attribution of airs to him, would be an interesting addendum to O'Sullivan's chapter on this topic in his book on the harper/composer.⁴⁶ The second gives a possible source for the term "planxty". The origin of this musical term is currently not known,⁴⁷ and Bunting's source for it is possibly unique information.⁴⁸ In addition to the annotations, the volumes contain handwritten revisions to the published music, including some well-known airs such as "Carolan's Concerto". A facsimile is given in figures 3 and 4, below.

⁴² O'Sullivan (1926), xxxv-xxxvii.

⁴³ O'Sullivan (1926), p. 6.

⁴⁴ *Bunting Collection MS/4*, [Internet] The Library Queens University, Belfast <http://www.qub.ac.uk/directorates/InformationServices/TheLibrary/FileStore/Filetoupload,12980,en.pdf> [accessed 13 April 2010]

⁴⁵ The binding information written on the end page of the bound volume reads, "Rebound by BM, No. of folios i + 90, Date July 1938, by CHC, Examined by P.E. J.E."

⁴⁶ O'Sullivan, D. (1958) Carolan as Poet and Musician. In: *Carolan: The Life, Times, and Music of an Irish Harper*. Republished (2001), London, Ossian Publications, pp. 91-98.

⁴⁷ O'Sullivan (1958), p. 93.

⁴⁸ The author regrets that there is not space in this paper to discuss the Carolan annotations to the full extent that they deserve. This topic will, however, be left for a future paper.

Figure 3.
BL Addl 41508, f.f 41v-42r, Bunting (1809), p.33
“*Comhshinnim Chearbhulain / Carolan’s Concerto*”

*BL Addl 41508, f. 42r, Bunting (1809) p. 33, showing
revisions to “Comhshinnim Chearbhulain / Carolan’s
Concerto”*

Figure 4.
BL Addl 41508, f. 41v, interleave facing Bunting (1809), p. 33

*Interleave facing p. 33 of BL Addl 41508, Bunting (1809),
showing revisions to “Comhshinnim Chearbhulain /
Carolan’s Concerto”*

A facsimile of the page for the air “*Graine Nuinsean*”, or “Grace Nugent”, from Bunting (1796) is reproduced in figure 5. It shows the first four measures of the second part crossed out, and the bar lines redrawn. The revised measures are written on the facing interleave, reproduced in figure 6. An upbeat measure has been created and the subsequent bar lines have been shifted. Harmony notes have been added in the alto voice, and the melody has been changed with the addition of two crotchets at the beginning of bar 3. The version of this air given in O’Sullivan (1930)⁴⁹ does not contain these revisions. Next to the first line of printed music, “Harp O Neil” is written as the source of the tune. The “O Neil” presumably refers to Arthur O’Neill, harp teacher of James MacDonnell and attendee of the 1792 gathering of harpers in Belfast.⁵⁰ Arthur O’Neill is credited as the source for numerous airs in Bunting’s manuscript collection,⁵¹ but this annotation is the only instance where any source is given for this air.

⁴⁹ O’Sullivan (1925-1939), III, p. 72.

⁵⁰ Fox (1912), *Memoirs of Arthur O’Neill*, pp. 137-200.

⁵¹ Moloney (2000), p. 696.

Figure 5.
BL Addl 41508, f. 89v, Bunting (1796), p.36, No. 65
“ *Graine Nuinsean / Grace Nugent*”

Page 36 of BL Addl 41508, Bunting (1796) with revisions to the notated music for the air “Grace Nugent” and a note indicating “Harp O Neil” as the source.

Figure 6.
BL Addl 41508, f. 90r, interleave facing Bunting (1796), p. 36

Interleave facing page 36 of the annotated Bunting (1796) showing handwritten revisions to the notated music for “Grace Nugent”.

The page for the air “*Im bo agus Samha bo*”, or “Burn’s March”, from Bunting (1809) is reproduced in figure 7. Revisions have been made to the bass accompaniment in lines 1, 2, 5, and 6. The author asked Eleanor Smith, an Edinburgh University postgraduate student to play Burn’s March on a c. 1805 square piano,⁵² as this is the type of instrument for which Bunting intended his arrangements. She played the air both with and without the revisions, commenting that the revisions to the bass made it less awkward to play, as it required fewer changes in hand position. She also found the revised bass a bit more interesting harmonically, and conjectured that the sparser bass of the original version would work better on an instrument with a longer sustain (noting that the sustain pedal on the early 19th century square pianos is not as controllable as on modern pianos, so would probably not have been used as much).⁵³ Her comment on playability suggests that the revisions were in fact targeted for amateur piano players, such as the Belfast society women Bunting taught in his youth. Her comment on the sustain and the spare bass is very interesting, as the early Irish harp is notable for its very long sustain. The published version of this air would be just playable on that instrument with the removal of a few bass chord notes. In general the basses of Bunting’s published arrangements are too thick for the early Irish harp, and likewise the manuscript versions of the airs as played by the harpers would sound spare and thin on the piano.

⁵² Built by Andrew Rothead, Edinburgh, c. 1805. Edinburgh University Collection of Historical Musical Instruments.

⁵³ Smith, E. (March, 2010) personal communication.

Figure 7.
BL Addl 41508, f. 25v, Bunting (1809), p. 6
“Im bo agas Samha bo / Burn’s March”

Page 6 of the annotated copy of Bunting (1809) with revisions to the notated music for “Burn’s March” along with background information and commentary on the air.

The annotations at the top of p. 6 of the page with “Burn’s March” read “one of the first tunes taught to the young Harpers and one of the 1st in which grace notes appear”,

and “From Hempson”. The comment, “This is one of the first tunes taught young Irish Harpers” appears in Bunting’s archived manuscripts associated with this air.⁵⁴ This information does not appear in any of Bunting’s published volumes. Likewise, the listing of “Hempson” as the source agrees with the attribution in Bunting’s manuscripts, but is also absent from the published volumes.⁵⁵ The published music is actually a combination of two sets of variations attributed to O’Hampsey (Hempson) and Patrick Quinn in Bunting’s manuscripts.

Figure 8 is an enlarged view of the annotations written into the bottom margin of p. 6 of Bunting (1809), underneath the notated music for “Burn’s March”.

Figure 8.
BL Addl 41508, f. 25v, Bunting (1809), p. 6
“*Im bo agas Samha bo / Burn’s March*”, bottom margin

The annotation reads

“This melody is very ancient being composed without the intervals of 4th and 7th many different sets of the air are current in Ireland. It is said to have been composed for the Burns’s who were Lords of the marshes or papes near Newry in the 13th century [see the peerage and get an anecdote of them] many songs were adapted to this tune one of which is ‘Did you see the black rogue’”⁵⁶

It is clear from the titles of Bunting’s published volumes and from his dissertations on the music that he was keen to establish the ancient pedigree of Irish music. This is reflected in the annotation for Burn’s March. The comment that the tune lacks the intervals of the 4th and 7th is a reference to it having a gapped scale, which is considered to be a hallmark of early Gaelic music.⁵⁷ The reference to the Burns’s is very interesting, as there is no information on the source of the “Burn’s March” title to this air anywhere in Bunting’s published work or surviving manuscripts. The reference to “Did you see the black rogue” is also interesting. The tune for Burn’s

⁵⁴ Bunting Collection, ms 12, f. 64v. Referenced in Moloney (2000), p. 240

⁵⁵ *ibid*, ms 33(3) f. 9v – 10r.

⁵⁶ BL Addl 41508, f. 26v, Bunting (1809) p. 6.

⁵⁷ Gilchrist, A. (1911) Note on the Modal System of Gaelic Tunes, *Journal of the Folk Song Society*. 4(16), December, pp. 150-153.

March appears under several different titles in Bunting's manuscript notebooks, including "Take care of the rogue coming thro the marsh". "The Black Rogue" is an old Irish song whose text survives in Irish.⁵⁸ It's possible that this is a reference to the same song, and that the Irish words to "The Black Rogue" fit the melody for Burn's March, although Bunting's version is a variation set that, with the exception of the refrain, is not sing-able. An air that closely resembles "Burn's March" is recorded in an 18th century collection of Scottish vocal airs.⁵⁹ It's possible that the melody in this air is the one Bunting is referencing in his comments.

The annotations in these two volumes represent an extensive amount of work. A few of them indicate that they were written after the publication of his 1840 volume, when Bunting was nearly 70 years old.⁶⁰ Assuming that they are his own, why did he put this much effort into annotating work he had published years earlier? One clue is in the preface to his 1840 volume, in which he "proposes to re-arrange and republish, with notices of the airs, similar to those of the present publication, the two volumes above spoken of."⁶¹ His 1840 volume is prefaced by a ninety-seven page dissertation, with examples, on the "Ancient Music of Ireland". By comparison, his twenty-eight page "Historical and Critical Dissertation on the Harp" that prefaces his 1809 volume is short, and the preface to his 1796 volume is only five pages long. Given the nature and content of the annotations, it is probable that they are his preparations for republishing his first two volumes with the addition of extensive background and commentary on the music, similar to that found in his 1840 volume. One of his motivations for doing this may have been the fact that his first volume was pirated, depriving him and his publisher of much of their potential profits.⁶² Another motivating factor may have been Thomas Moore, the author of the highly successful "Moore's Irish Melodies, which included 38 airs taken, without attribution, from Bunting's first two volumes and rearranged into romantic settings by Sir John Stevenson."⁶³ Bunting makes a fairly direct reference to this in the preface to his 1840 volume, pointing out that he was the one who collected the music "in repeated journeys through all parts of the country...even though in doing so he had no other prospect than that of seeing these fruits of his labour caught up as soon as they appeared", and refers to Stevenson's romantic settings as "the violence done by the musical arranger" to the airs.⁶⁴ He is even more direct in a footnote to a backhanded compliment to Moore's handling of his published airs, viz. "In fact, eleven out of the sixteen airs in Mr. Moore's first number were taken immediately from the volume above-mentioned."⁶⁵ Fox (1912) recounts Moore's conceited reaction to Bunting's statements in his diary, "He lays the blame of all these alterations upon Stevenson, but poor Sir John was entirely innocent of them; as the whole task of selecting the airs

⁵⁸ O'Lochlainn, Colm (1930), Irish Traditional Music Archive, referenced in Kadde (2007) *The Versions of "An Rogaire Dubh"* <http://blogs.myspace.com/index.cfm?fuseaction=blog.view&friendId=2264170&blogId=340069386> [accessed 13 April 2010].

⁵⁹ McDonald, P. (1784) untitled #141, in *The Patrick McDonald Collection*. Republished (2000), Edinburgh, Taigh na Teud, p. 41.

⁶⁰ e.g. Bunting (1796) p. 28, f. 85v "very like the chanters tune in last vol 1840".

⁶¹ Bunting, E. (1840), p. 11

⁶² Moloney (2000), p. 162

⁶³ ní Chinnéide, V. (1959) The Sources of Moore's Melodies, *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland*, 89 (2), p. 116.

⁶⁴ Bunting (1840), p. 5

⁶⁵ *ibid.*

and in some instances shaping them thus...was undertaken solely by myself.”⁶⁶ Moore takes this a step further by stating “Had I not ventured on these very admissible liberties many of the songs now most known and popular would have been still sleeping with all their authentic dress about them in Mr. Bunting’s first volume.”⁶⁷ So, as far as Moore is concerned, Bunting should thank him for stealing his work.

Moore had achieved fame, thanks to the success of his “Irish Melodies”, and Bunting may have wanted to give his first two volumes a second chance, with material that Moore’s publications lacked: extensive background information and commentary derived directly from the musicians Bunting had visited in the field.

It is clear from the evidence that the annotations in these two volumes are almost certainly Edward Bunting’s, and that they represent the preparatory work for the republication of his first two volumes of Irish music. Unfortunately, he passed away before he could see this project through to completion. As noted in the introduction to this paper, it’s not possible to overstate the importance of these annotations. His extended commentary on Turlough O’Carolan alone would make these an invaluable treasure. In addition to that there is the mass of unique anecdotal and historical information supplied for the airs that is missing from Bunting’s surviving manuscript notebooks, the attributions given for many airs whose source was previously unknown, and the handwritten revisions to the printed music. Whether or not we approve of Bunting’s piano arrangements of the airs, it is important to remember that he collected directly from the Irish harpers, and is our final witness and last direct link to the Irish harp tradition. His revision of “Carolan’s Concerto” is the last version written by someone who heard it directly played by the Irish harpers. These two invaluable volumes contain the final “chapter” of Edward Bunting’s life’s work, written shortly before he died in 1843; the final word from the man who saw the last Irish harpers before they disappeared forever.

Acknowledgements:

The author gratefully acknowledges the following individuals for their assistance with this project:

Dr. Elaine Kelly, University of Edinburgh
 Simon Chadwick, Historical Harp Society of Ireland
 Dr. Colette Moloney, Waterford Institute of Technology
 Eleanor Smith, University of Edinburgh

⁶⁶ Fox (1912), p. 29

⁶⁷ *ibid.*

Appendix I. Cross Index of Sources of the music Published in Bunting (1809) – Partial List

| Title | Source (Moloney, O’Sullivan) | Source (BL Addl 41508, Bunting, 1809) |
|------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|
| The Charming Fair Eily / <i>Eilighe Gheall chiun</i> | 33(3) f. 26r - “From James Duncan County Down”, Moloney (2000) p. 392, James Duncan , O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 3. | Harp / O Neil |
| The Song of Sorrow / Ulican dubh Oh | Hempson , 33(3) f. 11v, Moloney (2000) p. 390. Hempson , 33(3) p. 22, O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 7. | Harp / Hempson |
| Burn’s March / Im Bo Agas Samha Bo | “ Quins Burns March”, 33(1) ff. 31r - 32r, Moloney (2000) p. 379. “From Dennis Hempson of Magilligan”, 33(3) f. 10r, Moloney (2000) p. 390. Dennis Hempson , O’Sullivan (2000) IV, p. 16. | Harp / Hempson |
| Hulet’s Health / Slainte Breag Huilet | “from Blind Billy ” (verse only), 24 ff. 21v -25v, Moloney (2000) p. 298. “Bunting does not state from whom he obtained this lively air. There is no independent printed variant.”, O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 19. | old man thatching a house in Sligo, 1792 |
| Planxty Irwin / Plangstigh Erwin | “from Charles Byrne County Leitrim”, 33(3) f. 4r, Moloney (2000) p. 389. 36 f.83v “Miss Balfour” (verse only), Moloney, (2000) p. 432. Charles Byrne , O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 21. | Harp / Higgins |
| O Rourke’s Feast / Pleidh Raca Na Ruarcach | “From Rose Mooney ”, 33(2) f. 7r, Moloney (2000) p. 382. Rose Mooney , O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 26. | Harp / O Neil |
| The Captivating Youth / Oganaihe Oig | no source given in Moloney (2000) or O’Sullivan (1925- | Harp / Byrne |

| | | |
|-------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| | 1939) | |
| Yellow Horse / Gearan Buidhe | “from Hugh Higgins ”, 33(2) f. 6r, Moloney (2000) p. 381. Hugh Higgins , O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 30. | no source given |
| The Dissipated Youth / A Ghiolladh Na Sgriobe | no source given in Moloney (2000) or O’Sullivan (1925-1939) | Harp / Kate Martin |
| The Ship That Was Lost / Long a Chuagh a Mughha | no source given in Moloney (2000) or O’Sullivan (1925-1939) | no source given |
| Planxty Connor / Plangstigh Connor | “From Dennis Hempson Magilligan”, 33(2) f. 24v, Moloney (2000) p. 384. “Billy’s set”, 33(1) f. 17r, (verse only), Moloney (2000) p. 377. | Harp / Rose Mooney |
| Mac Farlane’s Lamentation / Cumha Mhac Parlain | Mrs. Connor , O’Sullivan, IV (1932) p. 44. | no source given |
| The Slender Coat / An Cota Caol | W.R. Spencer (verse only), 28 f. 68v, Moloney (2000) p. 339. Mrs. Connor , O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 47. | no source given |
| Rose Dillon / Roise Diolun | no source given in Moloney (2000) or O’Sullivan (1925-1939) | Harp / Fanning |
| Yellow Wat & the Fox / Bhateur Buidhe agas an Sinnach | Lynch (verse only), O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 50. | no source given |
| Planxty Reilly / Plangstigh Raighle | no source given in Moloney (2000) or O’Sullivan (1925-1939) | Harp / O Neil |

Appendix II. Cross Index of Sources of the Music Published in Bunting (1796) – Partial List

| Title | Source (Moloney, O’Sullivan) | Source (BL Addl 41508, Bunting, 1796) |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| If to a Foreign Clime You Go / A gCoigrich Má Théigheann Tú | Nancy McLoughlin (verse only) 7 f. 1r-4v, Moloney (2000) p. 206. “ at Mr. Burkes Carrackeel, Mayo ”, O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 4. | “ at Mr Burkes Carrackeel Mayo ” (f. 70r, p.1) |
| The Foxes Sleep / Codladh An tSionnaigh | No source given in Moloney’s catalogue of the Bunting mss, Moloney (2000). “According to a note written by Bunting in his personal copy of the 1796 volume (which is deposited with his manuscripts) he obtained ‘The Fox’s Sleep’ from Dennis Hempson , the blind harper of magilligan, County Derry, in 1792” (O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 6. | Harp / Hempson (f. 70r, p. 1) |
| Joice’s Tune / Spéic Seóigheach | No source given in Moloney’s catalogue of the Bunting mss, Moloney (2000). “Obtained by Bunting at Ballinrobe , County Mayo in 1792”, O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 9. | Ballinrobe (f. 70v, p. 2) |
| The Brown Thorn / An Droighneean Donn | Miss Balfour 36 ff. 84r-v (verse only), Moloney (2000) p. “He obtained it at Sligo ‘from a man whilst thatching a house’ ”, O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 14. | “ Sligo / perfect / got from a man whilst thatching a house ” (f. 70v, p. 2) |
| Fairy Queen / Bainreioghan na Síodhbhradh | No source given in Moloney’s catalogue of the Bunting mss, Moloney (2000). “no MS copy...noted down by Bunting from the playing of Arthur O’Neill ”, O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 18. "In a note against 'The Fairy Queen' in his personal copy of the 1796 volume, Bunting has | Harp / O Neil “ This tune is not Carolan's but was adapted by him from an original melody. It had two other parts which are not in the collection published at Christ Church yard by Neale” (f. 72r, p. 3) |

| | | |
|-----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| | written, ‘This tune is not Carolan's, but was adapted by him from an original melody’ ”, O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 18. | |
| Girls Have You Seen George / A’ bhFaca Sibh Seórse? | Dennis a Hempson 29 f. 13r, Moloney (2000) p. 390. Hempson , O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 20. | Harp / Hempson |
| The Summer is Coming / Tá An Samhradh Ag Teacht | “Not very ancient so says Hempson ” 29 f. 93 v., Moloney, (2000) p. 356. Hempson , O’Sullivan (2000) I, p. 21 | Harp / Hempson |
| Kitty Tyrrel / Caitilín Triall | O’ Beirne (verse only) 10 f. 2r, Moloney (2000) p. 215. Hugh Higgins , O’Sullivan (2000) I, p. 24. | Harp / Higgins |
| The Beardless Boy / Giolla Na Sgríob | No source given in Moloney’s catalogue of the Bunting mss, Moloney (2000). Kate Martin , O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p.28. | Harp / Kate Martin |
| Planxty Drury / Plangstaí Drúiridhe | No source given in Moloney’s catalogue of the Bunting mss, Moloney (2000). Byrne , O’Sullivan (1926-6) I, p. 37. | Harp / Byrne |
| Old Truagh / An Triúcha | No source given in Moloney’s catalogue of the Bunting mss, Moloney (2000). “Obtained from Arthur O’Neill...no manuscript of this air can be found” , O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 41. | Harp / O Neil (f. 74r?, p. 7 |
| If the Cat had Gold | “Marked ‘Harp. O’Donnell’ by Bunting in his personal copy of the 1796 volume” , O’Sullivan (1930) III, p. 56. | Harp / O Donnell |

Appendix III. Transcription of Sample Commentary on the Harper/Composer Turlough O'Carolan in BL Addl 41508

f. 57r, Bunting (1809) (written in very faint pencil)

“My opinion of Carolan is that he has a good Ear for music and it is remarkable how he, beginning the harp at 16 years of age could have composed those airs called Plangstys which he ^{^is said^} seems to have been the inventor of, as well as all the other tunes similar to ‘Colonel O’Hara’. because at that age 16 years the mind and habits are mostly fixed; and it is well known that persons who endeavor to learn music nowadays seldom attain any perfection after this period of life and it would appear to be more necessary to begin music early to attain that perfection in Execution on the instruments chosen than any of the other arts or sciences, but Carolan did not compose any of his airs in the Irish manner except one ‘Bridget Cruise (which doubt being his) to whom he was attached. This air in my 1st vol: 1796 is so unlike his other melody’s [sic] that I suspect the air is pure old Irish – Carolan made words for all those melodies that go by his name. ~~as author to confirm~~ which give occasion to the Harpers of the succeeding generation to attribute both music & words to him, this has led to the mistake (mention here his [illegible] called port Athol in Scotch Books & McCuach [illegible] tune in Burke Thumoth Book 1725) Carolan’s celebrity might have been owing in a [illegible] to the Patronage of the Lady, who [illegible] harp and who watched over him [illegible] so many years so that circumstances alone he may be [illegible] thought so. Reminiscent over all this controversy (his music in the shape is like Irish has no resemblance or features like it)”

f. 27r, Bunting (1809), p. 7. (erased pencil annotations in the bottom margin below the printed notation for “Plangstigh Erwin / Planxty Irwin”)

“... several being in simple common time it appears the tune was called Plangsty from being danced on Planks of Wood”

Annotations in BL Addl 41508 (Bunting (1809), and Bunting (1796))

| Title | Annotations |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>The Charming Fair Eily <i>/ Eilighe Gheall chiun</i></p> | <p>1809, p. 1, f. 23r</p> <p>top: “Harp / O Neil”</p> <p>next to Irish title: “me Garbhin” (could be “Ni Chearbhuil” see ms33(3) f. 26r, referenced in Moloney, p. 392)</p> <p>bottom: “Probably the Eleanor O’Kirman mentioned by Hardiman”</p> <p>music revisions</p> |
| <p>The Song of Sorrow / Ulican dubh Oh</p> | <p>1809, p. 5, f. 25r</p> <p>top: “Harp / Hempson”</p> <p>bottom: “<u>Ulican dubh Oh</u>/If you go to the Country of Leitrim my darling/To taste of the Country Sweet/There you will have pleasure night; morning/Where Nymphs and Shepherds meet”</p> <p>“Scale with flat 7th introduced the fourth strongly marked in the 1st bar. The time bears all the marks of antiquity and the distinguishing trait of Irish music.”</p> <p>“The (?)iant occurs frequently”</p> |
| <p>Burn’s March / Im Bo Agas Samha Bo</p> | <p>1809, p. 6, f. 25v</p> <p>top: “one of the 1st tunes taught to the young harpers} and one of the 1st in which grace notes appear”</p> <p>“From Hempson”</p> <p>“viz” (music notation of two graces)</p> <p>bottom: “This melody is very ancient being composed without the intervals of 4th and 7th. Many different sets of the air are current in Ireland. It is said to have been composed for the Burns’s who were Lords of the marshes or papes near Newry in the 13th Century [see the peerage and get an anecdote of them]”</p> <p>“many songs were adapted to this tune one of which is ‘Did you see the black rogue’”</p> <p>music revisions</p> |
| <p>Hulet’s Health / Slainte Breag Huilet</p> | <p>1809, p. 7, f. 27r</p> |

| | |
|--------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | <p>top: (Irish title struck through)</p> <p>“author and date unknown”</p> <p>bottom: “from an old man whilst thatching a house in Sligo 1792”</p> |
| Planxty Irwin / Plangstigh Erwin | <p>1809, p. 7, f. 27r</p> <p>top: “Harp tune from Higgins”</p> <p>(Irish title struck through)</p> <p>“Carolan”</p> <p>bottom: “Composed for Irwin of Streamstown House”</p> <p>“From Thady Conallon in 1792”</p> <p>interleave: “The Planxty was not always in 6/8 time several of them being in simple common time”</p> <p>(erased pencil) “... several being in simple common time it appears the tune was called plangsty from being danced on Planks of wood” (illegible – cursive B)</p> <p>“Carolan does not appear to have been the inventor of this sort of melody, as one piece called Planxty Davis, claims a Date prior to Carolan’s compositions.”</p> |
| O Rourke’s Feast / Pleidh Raca Na Ruarcach | <p>1809, p. 8, f. 27v</p> <p>top: “Harp / O Neil”</p> <p>bottom: (extensive annotations in erased pencil) “...it was the habit of the harpers to...ignorance and incapability...studying the music which in his time without...”</p> |
| The Captivating Youth / Oganai ghe Oig | <p>1809, p. 11, f. 29r</p> <p>top: “Harp / Byrne”</p> <p>bottom: “Several different sets of this charming air are sung in different parts of Ireland and are known by a variety of names the melody but little altered from the present Copy it belongs to that () esteemed by the Editor the most ancient, of which the “Summer is coming” is one.”</p> |
| The Dissipated Youth / A Ghiolladh Na Sgriobe | <p>1809, p. 12, f. 29v</p> <p>top: “Harp / Kate Martin”</p> |

| | |
|-------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | <p>bottom: “A curious instance of the #7 & ♮7 in the first two bars and composed probably since the invention of the semitone harp of Nugent the Jesuit in the 15th century our harps being simply Diatonic”</p> |
| The Ship That Was Lost / Long a Chuagh a Mughha | <p>1809, p. 13, f. 30r bottom: “A very ancient air its perfect scale being a proof of the date”</p> |
| Planxty Connor / Plangstigh Connor | <p>1809, p. 13, f. 30r top: “Harp / Rose Mooney” bottom: “Called the Planks of Connaught, in Burke Thumoths Collection in 1724. and set as played on the harp”</p> |
| Mac Farlane’s Lamentation / Cumha Mhac Parlain | <p>1809, p. 14, f. 30v bottom: “One of the Caoinans, a very lovely and expressive air the words are of the 18th Century, but the Melody is unquestionably very ancient, as is proved by its primitive scale”</p> |
| The Slender Coat / An Cota Caol | <p>1809, p. 17, f. 33r bottom: “ This tune belongs to the same class as the ‘Green Woods’” “Young Mans Dream”</p> |
| Rose Dillon / Roise Diolun | <p>1809, p. 18, f. 33v top: “Harp / Fanning” bottom: “Insert Anecdote of the Dillons Earls of Roscommon” music revisions</p> |
| Yellow Wat & the Fox / Bhateur Buidhe agas an Sinnach | <p>1809, p. 19, f. 34r music revisions</p> |
| Planxty Reilly / Plangstigh Raighle | <p>1809, p.19, f. 34r Top: “Harp / O Neil” bottom: “By Carolan”</p> |

Sources of the music listed in the 1809 volume

| Title | Source (Moloney, O’Sullivan) | Source (annotated 1809) |
|------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------|
| The Charming Fair Eily / <i>Eilighe Gheall chiun</i> | 33(3) f. 26r - “From James Duncan County Down”, | Harp / O Neil |

| | | |
|-----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|
| | Moloney (2000) p. 392, James Duncan , O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 3. | |
| The Song of Sorrow / Ulican dubh Oh | Hempson , 33(3) f. 11v, Moloney (2000) p. 390. Hempson , 33(3) p. 22, O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 7. | Harp / Hempson |
| Burn’s March / Im Bo Agas Samha Bo | “ Quins Burns March ”, 33(1) ff. 31r - 32r, Moloney (2000) p. 379. “From Dennis Hempson of Magilligan”, 33(3) f. 10r, Moloney (2000) p. 390. Dennis Hempson , O’Sullivan (2000) IV, p. 16. | Harp / Hempson |
| Hulet’s Health / Slainte Breag Huilet | “from Blind Billy ” (verse only), 24 ff. 21v -25v, Moloney (2000) p. 298. “Bunting does not state from whom he obtained this lively air. There is no independent printed variant.”, O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 19. | old man thatching a house in Sligo, 1792 |
| Planxty Irwin / Plangstigh Erwin | “from Charles Byrne County Leitrim”, 33(3) f. 4r, Moloney (2000) p. 389. 36 f.83v “Miss Balfour” (verse only), Moloney, (2000) p. 432. Charles Byrne , O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 21. | Harp / Higgins |
| O Rourke’s Feast / Pleidh Raca Na Ruarcach | “From Rose Mooney ”, 33(2) f. 7r, Moloney (2000) p. 382. Rose Mooney , O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 26. | Harp / O Neil |
| The Captivating Youth / Oganaihe Oig | no source given in Moloney (2000) or O’Sullivan (1925-1936) | Harp / Byrne |
| Yellow Horse / Gearan Buidhe | “from Hugh Higgins ”, 33(2) f. 6r, Moloney (2000) p. 381. Hugh Higgins , O’Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 30. | |
| The Dissipated Youth / A Ghiolladh Na Sgriobe | no source given in Moloney (2000) or O’Sullivan (1925-1936) | Harp / Kate Martin |
| The Ship That Was Lost / | no source given in Moloney | |

| | | |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Long a Chuagh a Mughha | (2000) or O'Sullivan (1925-1936) | |
| Planxty Connor / Plangstigh Connor | "From Dennis Hempson Magilligan", 33(2) f. 24v, Moloney (2000) p. 384. "Billy's set", 33(1) f. 17r, (verse only), Moloney (2000) p. 377. | Harp / Rose Mooney |
| Mac Farlane's Lamentation / Cumha Mhac Parlain | Mrs. Connor , O'Sullivan, IV (1932) p. 44. | |
| The Slender Coat / An Cota Caol | W.R. Spencer (verse only), 28 f. 68v, Moloney (2000) p. 339. Mrs. Connor , O'Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 47. | |
| Rose Dillon / Roise Diolun | no source given in Moloney (2000) or O'Sullivan (1925-1936) | Harp / Fanning |
| Yellow Wat & the Fox / Bhateur Buidhe agas an Sinnach | Lynch (verse only), O'Sullivan (1932) IV, p. 50. | |
| Planxty Reilly / Plangstigh Raighle | no source given in Moloney (2000) or O'Sullivan (1925-1936) | Harp / O Neil |
| Lord Mayo / Tiagharna Mhaighe-eo | | Harp |
| Thou Flower of Virgins / A Phlur na Maighdion | | |
| Carolan's Cap / Barend Chearbhulain | | Harp / Mooney |
| Dermot O'Dowd / Diarmaid Ua Duda | | |
| Irish Lullaby / Is Im Bo Agas Eiriu | | |
| I'll Follow You Over the Mountain / Leanfadh me Thar an Thsliabh Thu | | Quin / Harp |
| A death Song / Marbhna no Cumba | | Quin / Harp |
| The Wren / Drolein | | |
| Bumper Squire Jones / Pleidh Raca na Jones | | Harp / O Neil |
| I Would Rather than Ireland / Bhfear Liom na Eire | | |
| Fair Molly / Malli Ban | | Harp / Byrne |
| The Beautious Fair Molly / Maille Dheas Bhan | | |
| Bridget Cruise / Brighid Cruise | | Harp / Higgins |
| The Old Woman / An Thseann Bheann Bhocht | | |
| Rory O Moor; King of Leixs March / Rhuairidhe Ua Mordha | | |

| | | |
|------------------------------------------------------------------|--|-----------------|
| O Neill's Cavalcade Marcaigheacht In Neill | | |
| Carolan's Concerto / Comhshinnim Chearbhulain | | Harp / Fanning |
| Love be Near Me / A Ghradh Luighe Lamh Liom | | Quin / Harp |
| Planxty Maguire / Plangstigh Mhag Uibhir | | Harp / Mooney |
| O Southern Breeze / A Chaoithe on Ndeas | | |
| Bundle of Rushes / Beartin Luachra | | |
| Colonel Irwin / Corneul Irbhin | | O Neil |
| That is the Road She Went / Siud e Siar an Rod | | |
| The Cavalcade of the Boyne / Marcaigheacht in Boinne | | |
| Loftus Jones / Loftus Jones | | Fanning / Harp |
| Dennis Dont be Threatening / A Dhonachadh na bi Fogarthach | | |
| The Green Woods of Triugha / Coilte Glasa an Triugha | | Harp / Black |
| Nancy of the Branching Tresses / Anna na Geraoibh | | |
| Paddy Mac Rory / Paidin Mhac Ruairidhe | | Harp / Byrne |
| The Butterfly / Feilican | | Harp / O Donnel |
| The Mock Feast / Pleidh Raca an Mhagadh | | |
| The Health of the Cup / Slainte an Chupan | | |
| Planxty Thomas Mc Judge / Tumais Mhac a Bhreithamhain | | Mooney / Harp |
| Mild Mable O'Kelly / Mabla Sheimh ini Cheallaidh | | Harp / Linden |
| The Fisherman / Is Casgaire ar Loch | | |
| Beside a Rath / Cois Leasa | | |
| The Dawning of Day / Eirghidhe an Lae | | Harp / Hempson |
| Colonel O Hara / Corneul Ua Hara | | Harp / Fanning |
| The Winnowing Sheet / Caiteach Roin | | |
| Letitea Burke / Lettighe a Burca | | Mooney / Harp |
| Limerick's Lamentation / Marbhna na Luimneach | | Harp |
| Peggy Ban / Mairgireud | | Harp / Hempson |
| The Pretty Girl Milking the Cow / Callin Beog Chruite na | | Harp / O Neil |

| | | |
|----------------------------------------------|--|------------------|
| Mbo | | |
| Madam Judge / Maghistreas ini Bhreithamuain | | Harp / O Neil |
| Planxty Judge / Plangstigh ini Bhreithamhain | | Harp |
| A Lesson for the Harp / Purth Clarsearch | | Harp / Hempson |
| Thou Blooming Treasure / Blaith na Seud | | |
| The Old Truigha / An Seann Triucha | | Harp / O Neil |
| Planxty Sudley / Plangstigh Sudhleidh | | Harp / O Donnell |
| The Pleasure of Harbours / Muiris na Ccuan | | |
| The Market Stake / Staca an Mharaga | | Harp / Higgins |
| Rusty Daniel / Domhnal Merigeach | | |
| Madam Birmingham / Maghistreas ini Ceoris | | Harp / Mooney |
| Planxty Birmingham / Plangstigh ini Ceoris | | Harp |
| Morgan Magan / Murach Mhac Ceanna | | Harp / Mooney |
| The Victorious Tree / Bille Buadhach | | |
| I Will be Taken / Beidh Mise la Gabhail | | |
| Young Cusac / Ciosogach Og | | |
| Young Bridget / Breed na Bhearlaidh | | |

Sources of the music listed in the 1796 volume

| Title | Source (Moloney, O'Sullivan) | Source (annotated 1796) |
|-------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|
| If to a Foreign Clime You Go / A gCoigrich Má Théigheann Tú | Nancy McLoughlin (verse only) 7 f. 1r-4v, Moloney (2000) p. 206. “at Mr. Burkes Carrackeel, Mayo”, O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 4. | “at Mr Burkes Carrackeel Mayo” (f. 70r, p.1) |
| The Foxes Sleep / Codladh An tSionnaigh | No source given in Moloney’s catalogue of the Bunting mss, Moloney (2000). “According to a note written by Bunting in his personal copy of the 1796 volume (which is deposited with his manuscripts) he obtained ‘The Fox’s Sleep’ | Harp / Hempson (f. 70r, p. 1) |

| | | |
|-----------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | from Dennis Hempson , the blind harper of magilligan, County Derry, in 1792” (O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 6. | |
| Joice’s Tune / Spéic Seóigheach | No source given in Moloney’s catalogue of the Bunting mss, Moloney (2000). “Obtained by Bunting at Ballinrobe , County Mayo in 1792”, O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 9. | Ballinrobe (f. 70v, p. 2) |
| The Brown Thorn / An Droighneean Donn | Miss Balfour 36 ff. 84r-v (verse only), Moloney (2000) p. “He obtained it at Sligo ‘from a man whilst thatching a house’ ”, O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 14. | “Sligo / perfect / got from a man whilst thatching a house” (f. 70v, p. 2) |
| Fairy Queen / Bainreioghan na Síodhbhradh | No source given in Moloney’s catalogue of the Bunting mss, Moloney (2000). “no MS copy...noted down by Bunting from the playing of Arthur O’Neill ”, O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 18. "In a note against 'The Fairy Queen' in his personal copy of the 1796 volume, Bunting has written, ‘This tune is not Carolan's, but was adapted by him from an original melody’ ”, O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 18. | Harp / O Neil “This tune is not Carolan's but was adapted by him from an original melody. It had two other parts which are not in the collection published at Christ Church yard by Neale” (f. 72r, p. 3) |
| Girls Have You Seen George / A’ bhFaca Sibh Seórse? | Dennis a Hempson 29 f. 13r, Moloney (2000) p. 390. Hempson , O’Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 20. | Harp / Hempson |
| The Summer is Coming / Tá An Samhradh Ag Teach | “Not very ancient so says Hempson ” 29 f. 93 v., Moloney, (2000) p. 356. Hempson , O’Sullivan (2000) I, p. 21 | Harp / Hempson |
| Kitty Tyrrel / Caitilín Triall | O’ Beirne (verse only) 10 f. 2r, Moloney (2000) p. 215. Hugh Higgins , O’Sullivan | Harp / Higgins |

| | | |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | (2000) I, p. 24. | |
| The Beardless Boy / Giolla Na Sgríob | No source given in Moloney's catalogue of the Bunting mss, Moloney (2000). Kate Martin , O'Sullivan (1925-6) I, p.28. | Harp / Kate Martin |
| Planxty Drury / Plangstaí Drúiridhe | No source given in Moloney's catalogue of the Bunting mss, Moloney (2000). Byrne , O'Sullivan (1926-6) I, p. 37. | Harp / Byrne |
| Old Truagh / An Triúcha | No source given in Moloney's catalogue of the Bunting mss, Moloney (2000). "Obtained from Arthur O'Neill...no manuscript of this air can be found" , O'Sullivan (1925-6) I, p. 41. | Harp / O Neil (f. 74r?, p. 7) |
| Molly St George | | Harp / Higgins |
| The Fair-haired Girl | | Harp / Byrne |
| Love in Secret | | Harp / O Neil |
| Open the Door Softly | | Harp / O Neil |
| Madame Cole | | Harp / O Neil |
| The Young Man's Dream | | Harp / Hempson |
| The Charmer with the Fair Locks | | |
| The Twisting of the Rope | | Harp / Mooney |
| Dennis Don't be Threatening | | |
| Planxty Kelly | | Harp / Byrne |
| The Pleasant Rocks | | Harp / Black |
| The Fair Woman | | |
| Rose Dillon | | Harp / O Neil |
| The Parting of Friends | | Harp / Hempson |
| The Ugly Tailor | | |
| Castle O'Neil | | |
| Kitty the Cuckoo | | |
| The Harvest Morn | | |
| John Heir of the Glen | | Dr. Shiel Ballyshannon |
| The Banks of the Shannon | | Byrne |
| The Brown Maid | | Harp / Higgins |
| The Jointure | | Harp / Higgins |
| The Forlorn Queen | | Harp / O Neil |
| The Snowy Breasted Pearl | | |
| Madge Malone | | Harp / Mooney |
| Dermot O Dowd | | Byrne |
| Kitty O Brian | | Harp / Fanning |
| My Dear Stay with Me | | Harp / O Neil |
| The Dear Black Maid | | |
| Mary do you Fancy Me | | |

| | | |
|----------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------|
| Carolan's Concerto | | Harp / O Neil |
| The Little Harvest Rose | | Harp / Higgins |
| Molly Macalpin | | Harp / Kate Martin |
| Abigal Judge | | Harp / Black |
| Planxty Reilly | | Harp / Quin |
| The Maid of the Valley | | |
| I Would Rather than Ireland | | Harp / Byrne |
| John O Reilly the Active | | Harp / O Neil |
| An Irish Lullaby | | Paddy Ward Drogheda |
| The Blossom of the Raspberry | | Harp / O Neil |
| The Lamentation of Owen O'Neil | | |
| Nanny McDermot roe | | Harp / Mooney |
| The Pretty Girl Milking the Cows | | Harp / O Neil |
| Isabella Burke | | |
| Young Terence McDonough | | |
| Have You seen my Valentine | | Harp / Black |
| Planxty Johnson | | Harp / Byrne |
| Bob Jordon | | Harp / Fanning |
| If the Cat had Gold | "Marked 'Harp. O'Donnell' by Bunting in his personal copy of the 1796 volume", O'Sullivan (1930) III, p. 56. | Harp / O Donnell |
| We Brought the Summer with us | | Harp / Higgins |
| Thomas O'Burk | | Harp / Mooney |
| The Little & Great Mountain | | From an old M.S. |
| Planxty McGuire | | Harp / Mooney |
| Grace Nugent | Miss Brooks (verse only) 36 f. 50r (Moloney, p. 428) | Harp / O Neil |
| Planxty Dillon | | Harp / O Neil |

Karen Loomis - 11 April, 2010